

# A Comparative Study of Moral Education Textbooks in Korea and Japan

Hyemin Han (Stanford University)

Sora Kim, Changwoo Jeong (Seoul National University)

Yutaka Kunii (Cyber Hankuk University of Foreign Studies)

# Introduction

- Investigate characteristics of morally educated person through analyzing moral exemplars presented in moral education textbooks → they reflect direction of moral education curriculum.
- Korea vs. Japan? Two representative countries publish moral education textbooks for moral education in school.

# Why exemplars?

- Students can learn both diverse moral perspectives and universal moral principle from various moral exemplars (e.g., Colby & Damon, 1992).
- Formation of morality through modeling and imitation (Bandura, 1988).
- They are real examples show how to integrate morality into self-concept (see Damon, 1984).

# How exemplars presented in textbooks?

- By famous saying or motto: e.g., Socrates and Goethe's quote.
- By lesson (with achievement): e.g., Confucius and Ogata's Analects.
- By life story: e.g., King Sejong and Shozo's biography.

# Subject & Method

- Korea: “Middle School Moral Education I” published by MiraeN.
- Japan: “Middle School Moral Education 1 & 2, Open up Tomorrow,” “The Note of Heart Middle School” published by Tokyo Shoseki.
- Use Chi-square and post-hoc pairwise test (Bonferroni corrected) to examine types of moral exemplars in both countries.

# How to classify?

- Gender: male vs. female
- Nationality: local vs. foreigner
- Occupation & status: e.g., king, politician, scholar, physician, patriot, athlete, etc. → balanced or not-biased, correspond to the recent trend of value diversification?
- Time period: ancient, postclassical, early modern, modern, and contemporary periods.
- Moral value and virtue

# Exemplars by (Gender x Nationality) (%)

Real persons presented in Korean moral education textbooks			Gender	Real persons presented in Japanese moral education textbooks		
Total	Foreigner	Local		Local	Foreigner	Total
<sup>1)</sup> 140 (82.4)	96 (87.3)	44 (73.3)	Male	74 (65.5)	20 (83.3)	94 (68.6)
30 (17.6)	14 (12.7)	16 (26.7)	Female	39 (34.5)	4 (16.7)	43 (31.4)
170 (100)	110 (64.7)	60 (35.3)	Total	<sup>2)</sup> 113 (80.5)	24 (19.5)	137 (100)

<sup>1)</sup> Significantly More Males in Korea,  $\chi^2 (1, N = 307) = 7.9, p < .005$ .

<sup>2)</sup> Significantly More Locals in Japan,  $\chi^2 (1, N = 307) = 68.68, p < .0001$ .

# Exemplars by (Occupation & Status) (%)

Korean			Occupation and Status	Japan		
Local	Foreigner	Total		Local	Foreigner	Total
8 (13.3)	8 (7.3)	16 (9.4)	Leading people of the society	4 (2.9)	2 (8.3)	2 (1.8)
9 (15.0)	51 (46.4)	<b>1)</b> 60 (35.3)	Religious person, thinker, and philosopher	8 (5.8)	6 (25.0)	2 (1.8)
4 (6.7)	12 (10.9)	16 (9.4)	Scholar	20 (14.6)	2 (8.3)	18 (15.9)
8 (13.3)	12 (10.9)	20 (11.8)	Entertainer, Athlete	15 (11.0)	2 (8.3)	13 (11.5)
3 (5.0)	0	3 (1.8)	Physician	7 (5.1)	1 (4.2)	6 (5.3)
0	5 (4.6)	5 (2.9)	People engaged in social movements	1 (0.7)	0	1 (0.9)



# Exemplars by (Occupation & Status) (%) (Cont.)

2 (3.3)	3 (2.7)	5 (2.9)	Student	<sup>2)</sup> 25 (18.3)	1 (4.2)	24 (21.2)
12 (20.0)	15 (13.6)	27 (15.9)	Writer	45 (32.8)	10 (41.7)	35 (31.0)
14 (23.3)	4 (3.6)	18 (10.6)	Etc.	12 (8.8)	0	12 (10.6)
60	110	170	Total	137	24	113

<sup>1)</sup> Religious persons, thinkers, and philosophers in Korea >> Japan,  $t(16) = 14.77, p < .0001$ .

<sup>2)</sup> Students in Japan >> Korea,  $t(16) = 6.53, p < .001$

# Exemplars by (Historical Backdrop)

## (%) (Cont.)

Real persons in Korean moral education textbooks			Period	Real persons in Japanese moral education textbooks			
Total	Foreigner	Local		Local	Foreigner	Total	
37 (21.8)	37	0	Ancient	0	2	2 (1.5)	
0 (0)	0	0	Postclassical	0	1	1 (0.7)	
20 (11.8)	9	11	Early modern	1	2	3 (2.2)	
21 (12.4)	15	6	Modern	13	8	21 (15.3)	
92 (54.1)	36 (21.2)	28	8	[Person passed away]	26	8	34 (24.8)
	56 (32.9)	21	35	[Person alive]	73	3	76 (55.5)
170 (100)	110	60	계	113	24	137 (100)	

<sup>1)</sup> Modern & Contemporary Japanese >> Modern Korea,  $t(8) = 3.11$ ,  $p < .05$ .

# Exemplars by (Value & Virtue)

## Content areas in moral education

Content areas in Korean moral education	Content areas in Japanese moral education
I as a moral self	Matters regarding me
Relationship with we, other, and society	Matters regarding a relationship with other
Relationship with country, nation, and earth community	Matters regarding a relationship with community or society
Relationship with nature and transcendent existence	Matters regarding a relationship with nature or sublimity

# Exemplars by (Value & Virtue) (%) (Area I & II)

Area	Value/Virtue	Frequency in Korean textbooks	Frequency in Japanese textbooks
I .I as a moral self / Matters regarding me	<b>1)</b> Autonomy	29	28
	Sincerity	19	5
	Self-control	14	2
	Total	62	35
II .Relationship with we, other, and society/ Matters regarding a relationship with other	Family affection	3	4
	Courtesy	2	3
	<b>2)</b> Cooperation	27	29
	Total	32	36

1) Autonomy most frequent in both countries.

2) Cooperation most frequent in both countries.

# Exemplars by (Value & Virtue) (%) (Area III)

III. Relationship with country, nation, and earth community / Matters regarding a relationship with community or society	1) Law-abidingness/Common good	6	16
	Fairness / Impartiality	11	4
	Tolerance	2	1
	School spirit / Local patriotism	0	6
	2) Patriotism	17	6
	Will to reunification	2	0
	Humanity	8	8
	Total	46	51

1) “Law-abidingness/Common good” in Japan > Korea,  $t(12) = 7.11$ ,  $p < .0001$ ).

2) Patriotism in Korea >> Japan,  $t(12) = 7.83$ ,  $p < .0001$ .

# Exemplars by (Value & Virtue) (%) (Area IV)

IV. Relationship with nature and transcendent existence / Matters regarding a relationship with nature or sublimity	Love for nature	5	9
	Respect for life	3	12
	<b>1)</b> Peace	22	4
	Total	30	25

<sup>1)</sup> Peace in Korea > Japan,  $t(4) = 6.77, p < .01$ .

# Synthetic comparison (Korea - 1)

- Emphasized virtues in Korea
  - Autonomy
  - Formation of desirable relations
  - Pursuit of just society
  - Reunification
  - Peace of mind
  - Filial piety + Respect for elderly  
(Confucianism)

# Synthetic comparison (Korea - 2)

- Other emphasized features in Korea
  - Self-reflection
  - Contribution to nation's development
  - Peaceful unification with pride in culture and tradition
- These virtues and features would be based on Confucianism tradition



# Synthetic comparison (Korea - 3)

- Many Confucianism philosopher exemplars
- Textbooks emphasize various Confucianism virtues, such as loyalty and self-sacrifice.
- Why? Confucianism has been combined with Korean culture and history, and deeply rooted in Korean mindset and history (e.g., civilization of Joseon = trial to establish moral kingdom).

# Synthetic comparison (Japan - 1)

- Emphasized virtues in Japan
  - Autonomy, Respect for life, Contribute to social development (= Korea)
  - Observance of community order
  - Law-abidingness
  - Strong loyalty + pride to culture and tradition

# Synthetic comparison (Japan - 2)

- Other emphasized features in Japan
  - Show many contemporary exemplars
  - Show many scholars, entertainers, athletes, and students.
  - Present moral values through lives of ordinary people (e.g., teenagers, peers).
  - Locals >> Foreigners

# Synthetic comparison (Japan - 3)

- Why sense of belonging to community and observance of law are strongly emphasized in Japan?
  - Influence of Confucianism since Shōtoku Taishi's Seventeenth-article constitution → became adopted to traditional society
  - Loyalty to lord or nation >> Family relation (filial piety) → became group consciousness
  - Japanese society has hierarchical structure, prioritized over blood relation.

# Conclusion

- Goal, content, education & evaluation method based on how educator set characteristics of morally desirable person.
- Discussion about ideal of morally educated person → foundation of moral education.